

PHIL 835:  
Global Justice and Health

Fall 2020  
Tuesdays, 3pm

Danielle Wenner  
[dwenner@andrew.cmu.edu](mailto:dwenner@andrew.cmu.edu)

**Course Description**

The course will be organized around three central questions. First: what is the scope of considerations of justice, and why? Are considerations of justice primarily (or only) domestic in scope, or can individuals and institutions have justice-based obligations to individuals and institutions in other nations? This section of the course will engage contemporary contributions to the debate between so-called “nationalists” and “cosmopolitans” about justice. Second: if obligations of justice are rooted in shared institutions, to what extent do shared institutions govern the life chances of global citizens? Many scholars in both the nationalist and cosmopolitan camps argue that some feature or features of shared institutions ground obligations of justice, and so the debate regarding the scope of justice claims becomes a debate about the nature and influence of global institutions. During this section of the course, we will consider in particular various institutions of global health and the extent to which those institutions are capable of grounding justice-based claims to access to health, healthcare, and the material and epistemic benefits of biomedical progress. Finally, third: if there are global justice-based claims to health, healthcare, or the products of biomedical progress, what do those claims entail? This section of the course will focus particularly on global public health policy, global health research, and the global intellectual property regime with an eye towards identifying those policies that are, or would be, in line with existing obligations of global health justice.

**Required Texts**

Course readings will be made available electronically no later than the Wednesday before each class meeting.

**Course Requirements**

Short Response Pieces – 30% - 7 short response pieces, with the lowest grade dropped. No longer than 4 double-spaced pages, the goal of the response piece is not expository but analytical. Argue for a thesis, raise an objection, or clarify a point that you think is important and interesting. Short response pieces are due **no later than 8am on the day of class**, and may (will) be used during class discussion.

Conference Paper Draft – 35% - A conference-length (~3000 words) paper on a relevant topic of your choosing. We will work together to determine the deadline.

Conference Paper Re-Write – 35% - A revision of your paper draft in light of significant feedback. Final paper is due no later than Sunday, December 20.

## **Policies**

Late short response pieces are not accepted. I have a zero-tolerance policy for cheating: any student found to have plagiarized on any assignment will receive a failing grade for the entire course, and all available institutional penalties will be sought.

These are strange and difficult times. If you encounter unexpected difficulties – of any kind – during this semester that you think will impact your ability to complete the work, please talk to me sooner than later. I will work with you to find a solution.

*If you wish to request an accommodation due to a documented disability, please notify me and contact Disability Resources at: [access@andrew.cmu.edu](mailto:access@andrew.cmu.edu) or 412-268-2013 as soon as possible.*

## **Outline of Topics & (Tentative) Schedule of Readings**

### **Part I: The Scope of Justice-Based Obligations**

#### 1<sup>st</sup> Meeting (1 Sept)

Charles Beitz (1979). "International Distributive Justice," Part 3 of *Political Theory and International Relations*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

#### 2<sup>nd</sup> Meeting (8 Sept)

Selections from John Rawls (1999). *Law of Peoples*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.  
Intro-§4; §§7-10; §§15-16.

#### 3<sup>rd</sup> Meeting (15 Sept)

Martha Nussbaum (2006). "Mutual Advantage and Global Inequality: The Transnational Social Contract," Chapter 4 of *Frontiers of Justice: Disability, Nationality, Species Membership*. Cambridge: Belknap Press.

John Rawls (1996). "The Basic Structure as Subject," Lecture VII of *Political Liberalism*. New York: Columbia University Press.

*Additional Recommended Reading: Ifeanyi A. Menkiti (2017). "Africa and Global Justice." *Philosophical Papers* 46(1): 13-32.*

#### 4<sup>th</sup> Meeting (22 Sept)

Thomas Nagel (2005). "The Problem of Global Justice," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 33(2): 113-47.

A.J. Julius (2006). "Nagel's Atlas," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 34(2): 176-92.

#### 5<sup>th</sup> Meeting (29 Sept)

Michael Blake (2001). "Distributive Justice, State Coercion, and Autonomy," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 30(3): 257-96.

Arash Abizadeh (2007). "Cooperation, Pervasive Impact, and Coercion: On the Scope (not Site) of Distributive Justice," *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 35(4): 318-58.

### 6<sup>th</sup> Meeting (6 Oct)

Olúfemi O. Táíwò (2019). "States Are Not Basic Structures: Against State-Centric Political Theory," *Philosophical Papers* **48**(1): 59-82.

Helena de Bres (2013). "Disaggregating Global Justice," *Social Theory and Practice* **39**(3): 422-448.

*Additional Recommended Reading: Andrea Sangiovanni (2007). "Global Justice, Reciprocity, and the State," Philosophy & Public Affairs* **35**(1): 3-39.

### 7<sup>th</sup> Meeting (13 Oct)

Miriam Ronzoni (2009). "The Global Order: A Case of Background Injustice? A Practice-Dependent Account," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* **37**(3): 229-56.

Dennis Masaka (2017). "'Global Justice' and the Suppressed Epistemologies of the Indigenous People of Africa," *Philosophical Papers* **46**(1): 59-84.

*Additional Recommended Reading: Miriam Ronzoni (2006). "Two Concepts of the Basic Structure, and Their Relevance to Global Justice," Global Justice: Theory, Practice, Rhetoric* **1**(1): 68-85.

## **Part II: Global Health Governance**

### 8<sup>th</sup> Meeting (20 Oct)

Benjamin Mason Meier and Florian Kastler (2018). "Development of Human Rights through WHO," in *Human Rights in Global Health: Rights-Based Governance for a Globalizing World*, eds. Benjamin Mason Meier & Lawrence O. Gostin. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Jennifer Prah Ruger (2005). "The Changing Role of the World Bank in Global Health," *American Journal of Public Health* **95**(1): 60-70.

### 9<sup>th</sup> Meeting (27 Oct)

Maud MTE Huynen, Pim Martens, and Henk BM Hilderink (2005). "The Health Impacts of Globalisation: A Conceptual Framework." *Globalization and Health* **1**(14).

Ronald Labonté, Katia Mohindra, and Ted Schrecker (2011). "The Growing Impact of Globalization for Health and Public Health Practice," *Annual Review of Public Health* **32**: 263-83.

### 10<sup>th</sup> Meeting (3 Nov) – possibly rescheduled

David P. Fidler (2007). "Architecture Amidst Anarchy: Global Health's Quest for Governance," *Global Health Governance* **1**(1): 1-17.

Jennifer Prah Ruger (2018). "Problems in Global Health and Governance," Part 1 of *Global Health Justice and Governance*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Johan A. Oldekop et al. "Covid-19 and the Case for Global Development," *World Development* **134**: 105044.

### **Part III: Global Health Justice**

#### 11<sup>th</sup> Meeting (10 Nov)

Norman Daniels (2008). "International Health Inequalities and Global Justice," ch. 13 of *Just Health: Meeting Health Needs Fairly*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Shlomi Segall (2010). "Global Justice and National Responsibility for Health," ch. 11 of *Health, Luck, and Justice*. Princeton: Princeton University Press

#### 12<sup>th</sup> Meeting (17 Nov)

Sridhar Venkatapuram (2012). "Health Inequalities, Capabilities, and Global Justice." in *Health Inequalities and Global Justice*, eds. Patti Tamara Lenard and Christine Straehle. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Madison Powers & Ruth Faden (2006). "Justice, Sufficiency, and Systematic Disadvantage, ch. 3 of *Social Justice: The Moral Foundation of Public Health and Health Policy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

#### 13<sup>th</sup> Meeting (24 Nov)

Thomas Pogge (2002). "Responsibilities for Poverty-Related Ill Health," *Ethics and International Affairs* **16**(2): 71-79.

James Dwyer (2005). "Global Health and Justice," *Bioethics* **19**(5-6): 460-75.

#### 14<sup>th</sup> Meeting (1 Dec)

Danielle Wenner (2018). "The Social Value Requirement in Research: From the Transactional to the Basic Structure Model of Stakeholder Obligations." *Hastings Center Report* **48**(6): 25-32.

Johannes Kneiss (2019). "Justice in the Social Distribution of Health." *Social Theory & Practice* **45**(3): 397-425.

#### 15<sup>th</sup> Meeting (8 Dec)

Thomas Pogge (2010). "The Health Impact Fund: Better Pharmaceutical Innovations at Much Lower Prices," in *Incentives for Global Public Health*, eds. Thomas Pogge, Matthew Rimmer, and Kim Rubenstein. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Kathleen Liddell (2010). "The Health Impact Fund: A Critique," in *Incentives for Global Public Health*, eds. Thomas Pogge, Matthew Rimmer, and Kim Rubenstein. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Jason W. Nickerson and Matthew Herder (2020). "COVID-19 Vaccines as Global Public Goods," in *Vulnerable: The Law, Policy, and Ethics of COVID-19*, eds. Colleen Flood et al. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press.